

# Smoothing operators in multi-marginal Optimal Transport

Ugo Bindini

Scuola Normale Superiore - Pisa

Optimal Transport Methods in Density Functional Theory  
Banff 2019

- 1 Multi-marginal Optimal Transport
- 2 A smoothing operator
  - Definition
  - Properties
- 3 Applications to Density Functional Theory
  - The semiclassical limit
  - Lieb's *open map* problem

# Multi-marginal Optimal Transport

Given  $\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N$  probability measures over  $\mathbb{R}^d$ , and a cost function  $c : (\mathbb{R}^d)^N \rightarrow [0, +\infty]$ , the Kantorovich formulation for the multi-marginal optimal transport problem is to minimize

$$\int_{(\mathbb{R}^d)^N} c(x_1, \dots, x_N) dP(x_1, \dots, x_N)$$

where  $P \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N) := \left\{ P \in \mathcal{P}((\mathbb{R}^d)^N) \mid \pi_{\#}^j(P) = \rho_j \text{ for all } j \right\}$ .

# Multi-marginal Optimal Transport

Fix  $p > 1$ .

# Multi-marginal Optimal Transport

Fix  $p > 1$ .

We say that  $\rho$  is  $W^{1,p}$ -regular if  $\rho$  is absolutely continuous w.r.t. the Lebesgue measure  $\mathcal{L}^d$ , and

$$\left( \frac{d\rho}{d\mathcal{L}^d} \right)^{1/p} \in W^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d).$$

We denote  $\mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  the space of  $W^{1,p}$ -regular probabilities.

# Multi-marginal Optimal Transport

Fix  $p > 1$ .

We say that  $\rho$  is  $W^{1,p}$ -regular if  $\rho$  is absolutely continuous w.r.t. the Lebesgue measure  $\mathcal{L}^d$ , and

$$\left( \frac{d\rho}{d\mathcal{L}^d} \right)^{1/p} \in W^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d).$$

We denote  $\mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  the space of  $W^{1,p}$ -regular probabilities.

When  $p = 2$  we recover the well-known space

$$\mathcal{R} := \left\{ \rho \mid \rho \geq 0, \int_{\mathbb{R}^d} \rho = 1, \sqrt{\rho} \in H^1(\mathbb{R}^d) \right\}.$$



H. Lieb, *Density Functionals for Coulomb Systems* (1983)

# Multi-marginal Optimal Transport

The space  $\mathcal{P}^{1,p}$  is a metric space with distance

$$\delta^{1,p}(\rho_1, \rho_2) = \left\| \left( \frac{d\rho_1}{d\mathcal{L}^d} \right)^{1/p} - \left( \frac{d\rho_2}{d\mathcal{L}^d} \right)^{1/p} \right\|_{W^{1,p}} .$$

# Multi-marginal Optimal Transport

The space  $\mathcal{P}^{1,p}$  is a metric space with distance

$$\delta^{1,p}(\rho_1, \rho_2) = \left\| \left( \frac{d\rho_1}{d\mathcal{L}^d} \right)^{1/p} - \left( \frac{d\rho_2}{d\mathcal{L}^d} \right)^{1/p} \right\|_{W^{1,p}}.$$

## Theorem

If  $P \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$ , then its marginals belong to  $\mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$ .

Moreover, the map

$$\begin{aligned} \pi: \mathcal{P}^{1,p}((\mathbb{R}^d)^N) &\longrightarrow \mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)^N \\ P &\longmapsto (\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N) \end{aligned}$$

is continuous w.r.t. the  $\delta^{1,p}$  metrics.

Let  $\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  and  $P \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ .

If  $P$  is not regular, we want to approximate  $P$  with  $(P_\varepsilon)_{\varepsilon>0}$  such that:

Let  $\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  and  $P \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ .

If  $P$  is not regular, we want to approximate  $P$  with  $(P_\varepsilon)_{\varepsilon>0}$  such that:

- $P_\varepsilon$  is  $W^{1,p}$ -regular;

Let  $\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  and  $P \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ .

If  $P$  is not regular, we want to approximate  $P$  with  $(P_\varepsilon)_{\varepsilon>0}$  such that:

- $P_\varepsilon$  is  $W^{1,p}$ -regular;
- $P_\varepsilon \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ ;

Let  $\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  and  $P \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ .

If  $P$  is not regular, we want to approximate  $P$  with  $(P_\varepsilon)_{\varepsilon>0}$  such that:

- $P_\varepsilon$  is  $W^{1,p}$ -regular;
- $P_\varepsilon \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ ;
- as  $\varepsilon \rightarrow 0$ ,  $P_\varepsilon$  converges to  $P$  (in a suitable sense).

Let  $\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  and  $P \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ .

If  $P$  is not regular, we want to approximate  $P$  with  $(P_\varepsilon)_{\varepsilon>0}$  such that:

- $P_\varepsilon$  is  $W^{1,p}$ -regular;
- $P_\varepsilon \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ ;
- as  $\varepsilon \rightarrow 0$ ,  $P_\varepsilon$  converges to  $P$  (in a suitable sense).

Since  $P$  in general is only a measure, the “suitable sense” is the weak convergence of measures (in duality with  $C_b$ ).

# Smoothing operator: definition

Let  $\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  and  $P \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ .

# Smoothing operator: definition

Let  $\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  and  $P \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ .

For every  $\varepsilon > 0$  consider a Gaussian kernel on  $\mathbb{R}^d$

$$\eta^\varepsilon(z) = \frac{1}{(2\pi\varepsilon)^{d/2}} \exp\left(-\frac{|z|^2}{2\varepsilon}\right),$$

and define

$$P_\varepsilon(X) := \Theta^\varepsilon[P](X) = \iint \prod_{j=1}^N \frac{\rho_j(x_j) \eta^\varepsilon(y_j - x_j) \eta^\varepsilon(y_j - z_j)}{(\rho_j * \eta^\varepsilon)(y_j)} dP(Z) dY.$$

# Smoothing operator: definition

Let  $\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  and  $P \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ .

For every  $\varepsilon > 0$  consider a Gaussian kernel on  $\mathbb{R}^d$

$$\eta^\varepsilon(z) = \frac{1}{(2\pi\varepsilon)^{d/2}} \exp\left(-\frac{|z|^2}{2\varepsilon}\right),$$

and define

$$P_\varepsilon(X) := \Theta^\varepsilon[P](X) = \iint \prod_{j=1}^N \frac{\rho_j(x_j) \eta^\varepsilon(y_j - x_j) \eta^\varepsilon(y_j - z_j)}{(\rho_j * \eta^\varepsilon)(y_j)} dP(Z) dY.$$

Remark The marginals are recovered:  $\Theta^\varepsilon[P] \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$ .

# Properties of $\Theta^\varepsilon$ : regularity

$\Theta^\varepsilon[P]$  is  $W^{1,p}$ -regular, with a kinetic energy control:

$$T(\Theta^\varepsilon[P]) \leq \sum_{j=1}^N \left( T(\rho_j)^{\frac{1}{p}} + \frac{c(d,p)}{\sqrt{\varepsilon}} \right)^p.$$

# Properties of $\Theta^\varepsilon$ : regularity

$\Theta^\varepsilon[P]$  is  $W^{1,p}$ -regular, with a kinetic energy control:

$$T(\Theta^\varepsilon[P]) \leq \sum_{j=1}^N \left( T(\rho_j)^{\frac{1}{p}} + \frac{c(d,p)}{\sqrt{\varepsilon}} \right)^p.$$

If in addition  $P \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$ , then

$$T(\Theta^\varepsilon[P]) \leq \sum_{j=1}^N \left( \left\| \nabla_{x_j} (P * \eta^\varepsilon)^{\frac{1}{p}} \right\|_p + c_p \Delta(\varepsilon, p, \rho_j) \right)^p$$

where

$$\Delta(\varepsilon, p, \rho) = \begin{cases} \left[ (T(\rho) + T(\rho * \eta^\varepsilon))^{\frac{1}{p-1}} - 2T(\rho * \eta^\varepsilon)^{\frac{1}{p-1}} \right]^{\frac{p-1}{p}} & 1 < p < 2 \\ (T(\rho) - T(\rho * \eta^\varepsilon))^{\frac{1}{p}} & p \geq 2. \end{cases}$$

## Proposition

Let  $P \in \mathcal{P}((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$ . Then  $\Theta^\varepsilon[P] \rightarrow P$ , i.e., for every  $\phi \in C_b((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$

$$\lim_{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0} \int \phi(X) \Theta^\varepsilon[P](X) dX = \int \phi(X) dP(X).$$

# Properties of $\Theta^\varepsilon$ : continuity I

## Proposition

Let  $P \in \mathcal{P}((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$ . Then  $\Theta^\varepsilon[P] \rightarrow P$ , i.e., for every  $\phi \in C_b((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$

$$\lim_{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0} \int \phi(X) \Theta^\varepsilon[P](X) dX = \int \phi(X) dP(X).$$

If  $P$  is itself  $W^{1,p}$ -regular, then we get:

## Proposition

Let  $P \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$ . Then

$$\lim_{\varepsilon \rightarrow 0} \delta^{1,p}(\Theta^\varepsilon[P], P) = 0.$$

# Properties of $\Theta^\varepsilon$ : continuity II

Consider  $\Theta$  as an operator

$$\Theta : (0, +\infty) \times \mathcal{P} \left( (\mathbb{R}^d)^N \right) \longrightarrow \mathcal{P}^{1,p} \left( (\mathbb{R}^d)^N \right).$$

# Properties of $\Theta^\varepsilon$ : continuity II

Consider  $\Theta$  as an operator

$$\Theta : (0, +\infty) \times \mathcal{P} \left( (\mathbb{R}^d)^N \right) \longrightarrow \mathcal{P}^{1,p} \left( (\mathbb{R}^d)^N \right).$$

*Remark.* The Propositions above give “continuity” with respect to the first argument  $\varepsilon$ . What about continuity in the second argument?

# Properties of $\Theta^\varepsilon$ : continuity II

Consider  $\Theta$  as an operator

$$\Theta : (0, +\infty) \times \mathcal{P} \left( (\mathbb{R}^d)^N \right) \longrightarrow \mathcal{P}^{1,p} \left( (\mathbb{R}^d)^N \right).$$

*Remark.* The Propositions above give “continuity” with respect to the first argument  $\varepsilon$ . What about continuity in the second argument?

## Theorem

Let  $P_n \in \Pi(\rho_1^n, \dots, \rho_N^n)$  and  $P \in \Pi(\rho_1, \dots, \rho_N)$  such that  $P_n \rightharpoonup P$ . Suppose moreover that  $\rho_j^n, \rho_j \in \mathcal{P}^{1,p}(\mathbb{R}^d)$ , and  $\delta^{1,p}(\rho_j^n, \rho_j) \rightarrow 0$ . Then, for every  $\varepsilon > 0$ ,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \delta^{1,p}(\Theta^\varepsilon[P_n], \Theta^\varepsilon[P]) = 0.$$

# Applications: the semiclassical limit of the HK functional

Consider the Hohenberg-Kohn functional

$$\mathcal{F}_{\hbar}^{HK}(\rho) = \inf_{\psi \mapsto \rho} \langle \psi | \hbar^2 T + V_{ee} | \psi \rangle.$$

## Theorem

As  $\hbar \rightarrow 0$ , the functional  $\mathcal{F}_{HK}^{\hbar}$   $\Gamma$ -converges to the Optimal Transport functional

$$\mathcal{C}(\rho) = \inf \left\{ \int \sum_{i < j} \frac{1}{|x_i - x_j|} dP(X) \mid P \in \Pi(\rho, \dots, \rho) \right\}.$$

Cotar-Friesecke-Klüppelberg (2013), B-De Pascale (2017),  
Cotar-Friesecke-Klüppelberg (2018), Lewin (2018)

## Applications: Lieb's *open map* question

Consider the map from  $H_{Sym}^1((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$  to  $\mathcal{R}$  which sends  $\psi$  to its marginal

$$\rho^\psi(x) = \int |\psi(x, x_2, \dots, x_N)|^2 dx_2 \cdots dx_N.$$

## Applications: Lieb's *open map* question

Consider the map from  $H_{Sym}^1((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$  to  $\mathcal{R}$  which sends  $\psi$  to its marginal

$$\rho^\psi(x) = \int |\psi(x, x_2, \dots, x_N)|^2 dx_2 \cdots dx_N.$$

Theorem (Lieb-Brezis 1983)

*The map is continuous.*

## Applications: Lieb's *open map* question

Consider the map from  $H_{Sym}^1((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$  to  $\mathcal{R}$  which sends  $\psi$  to its marginal

$$\rho^\psi(x) = \int |\psi(x, x_2, \dots, x_N)|^2 dx_2 \cdots dx_N.$$

### Theorem (Lieb-Brezis 1983)

*The map is continuous.*

**Question 2.** Although the map is not invertible (since it is not 1 : 1), we can ask the following: Given a sequence  $\rho_i^{1/2}$  that converges to  $\rho^{1/2}$  in the above  $H^1(\mathbb{R}^3)$  sense, and given some  $\psi$  satisfying (1.6) for  $\rho$ , does there exist a sequence  $\psi_i$ , [related to  $\rho_i$ , by (1.6)] that converges to  $\psi$  in the above  $H^1(\mathbb{R}^3)$  sense? [This is equivalent to the statement that the map  $\psi \mapsto \rho^{1/2}$  is “open,” that is, the map takes open sets in  $H^1(\mathbb{R}^{3N})$  into open sets in  $H^1(\mathbb{R}^3)$ .]

## Theorem (B-De Pascale 2019, to appear)

Let  $\psi \in H_{Sym}^1((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$  (real-valued), and  $\rho_n \in \mathcal{R}$  such that  $\rho_n \rightarrow \rho^\psi$ .  
Then there exist  $(\psi_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  such that:

- 1  $\psi_n$  maps to  $\rho_n$ ;
- 2  $\psi_n \rightarrow \psi$  in  $H_{Sym}^1((\mathbb{R}^d)^N)$  (complex-valued).

**Thanks for your attention!**