## HOW EFFECTIVELY CAN A MOLECULAR SWITCH SWITCH? A BOUND FROM THERMODYNAMIC RESOURCE THEORIES



#### NICOLE YUNGER HALPERN

Harvard-Smithsonian ITAMP Harvard University Department of Physics

NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).



"Algebraic and Statistical Ways into Quantum Resource Theories," BIRS, 23 July 2019







The photoisomer



# The photoisomer





# The photoisomer



Cis 0°









• Retinal



#### • Retinal



#### Solar-fuel storage

Kucharski *et al.*, Nat.
Chem. 6, 441 (2014).



#### • Retinal



#### Solar-fuel storage

Kucharski *et al.*, Nat.
Chem. 6, 441 (2014).



#### • Retinal



#### Solar-fuel storage

Kucharski *et al.*, Nat.
Chem. 6, 441 (2014).



# Photoisomers surface across nature and technologies. $\downarrow\downarrow$

₩

Worth asking,

"How effectively can these molecular switches switch?"



 $\Psi$ 

Worth asking, "How effectively can these molecular switches switch?"



But photoisomers are small, quantum, and far from equilibrium.

Worth asking, "How effectively can these molecular switches switch?"



But photoisomers are small, quantum, and far from equilibrium.

 $\downarrow$ 

Headway seems to require assumptions,

 $\Psi$ 

Worth asking,

"How effectively can these molecular switches switch?"



But photoisomers are small, quantum, and far from equilibrium.

## ₩

Headway seems to require assumptions, some of which can be distasteful.

#### Wanted

General, simple bounds on photoisomers' switching probability



#### Wanted

General, simple bounds on photoisomers' switching probability

> Photoisomerization yield





-Being used to extend the laws of thermodynamics...

• to small scales



-Being used to extend the laws of thermodynamics...

- to small scales
- to coherent quantum states



-Being used to extend the laws of thermodynamics...

- to small scales
- to coherent quantum states
- far from equilibrium



-Assumptions



-Assumptions

• Energy conservation



-Assumptions

- Energy conservation
- Environmental temperature



#### -Assumptions

- Energy conservation
- Environmental temperature
- Quantum theory



#### -Assumptions

- Energy conservation
- Environmental temperature
- Quantum theory

-<u>Style</u>: abstract quantum information theory



#### -<u>Assumptions</u>

- Energy conservation
- Environmental temperature
- Quantum theory

-<u>Style</u>: abstract quantum information theory —

Theorem Theorem Corollary *Theorem* Theorem Lemma Lemma





Model a photoisomer within a thermodynamic resource theory. ----







Model a photoisomer within a thermodynamic resource theory. -





• Theorem Corollary *Theorem* Theorem Lemma



Theorem

Lemma

Bound the switching probability, and characterize coherence's role in the switching.






Bound the switching probability, and characterize coherence's role in the switching.

#### NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).





Photoisomer background



Photoisomer background

• Quick review: thermodynamic resource theories



- Photoisomer background
- Quick review: thermodynamic resource theories
  - Results



- Photoisomer background
- Quick review: thermodynamic resource theories
  - Results
  - Model photoisomer in resource theory



- Photoisomer background
- Quick review: thermodynamic resource theories

#### • Results

- Model photoisomer in resource theory
- Bound photoisomerization probability

# Game plan

Photoisomer background

#### Quick review: thermodynamic resource theories

#### • Results

- Model photoisomer in resource theory
- Bound photoisomerization probability
- Electronic energy coherences can't increase the probability.

# Game plan



Photoisomer background

#### • Quick review: thermodynamic resource theories

#### • Results

- Model photoisomer in resource theory
- Bound photoisomerization probability
- Electronic energy coherences can't increase the probability.
  - Bonus results

# Game plan



Photoisomer background

#### • Quick review: thermodynamic resource theories

#### • Results

- Model photoisomer in resource theory
- Bound photoisomerization probability
- Electronic energy coherences can't increase the probability.

• Bonus results



# Photoisomer background















-Electronic degree of freedom



-Electronic degree of freedom























...



<u>Literature</u>: Lieb and Yngvason, Amer. Math. Soc. **45**, 5 (1998).
 Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000).
 Brandão *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **111**, 250404 (2013).



<u>Literature</u>: Lieb and Yngvason, Amer. Math. Soc. **45**, 5 (1998).
 Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000).
 Brandão *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **111**, 250404 (2013).

• How to specify a system:

...



<u>Literature</u>: Lieb and Yngvason, Amer. Math. Soc. **45**, 5 (1998).
 Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000).
 Brandão *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **111**, 250404 (2013).

• <u>How to specify a system</u>: *H* Hilbert space

...

...



<u>Literature</u>: Lieb and Yngvason, Amer. Math. Soc. **45**, 5 (1998).
 Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000).
 Brandão *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **111**, 250404 (2013).

• How to specify a system:  $\mathscr{H}$ ,  $(\rho, H)$ Hamiltonian Hilbert space Density operator

...



 <u>Literature</u>: Lieb and Yngvason, Amer. Math. Soc. **45**, 5 (1998). Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000). Brandão *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **111**, 250404 (2013).



...



<u>Literature</u>: Lieb and Yngvason, Amer. Math. Soc. **45**, 5 (1998).
 Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000).
 Brandão *et al.*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **111**, 250404 (2013).

• How to specify a system: 
$$\mathcal{H}$$
,  $(\rho, H)$   
Hilbert space Density operator  
• Agent given access to bath at  $\beta = \frac{1}{k_{\rm B}T}$   
• Free states: thermal relative to  $\beta \longrightarrow \left(\frac{e^{-\beta H_{\rm B}}}{Z}, H_{\rm B}\right)$
#### • Thermal operations

• Thermal operations (simplest of the options)

#### • Thermal operations

• Tend to thermalize states

#### Thermal operations

- Tend to thermalize states
- Each free operation consists of

TUDEE		
INKEE		
	SIMPLE	
		STEPS
		STEPS

#### Thermal operations

- Tend to thermalize states
- Each free operation consists of

А Мар	to Success in Business a	ind Life
THREE		
	SIMPLE	
		STEPS

1) Draw any free state from the bath.

#### Thermal operations

- Tend to thermalize states
- Each free operation consists of

NEW YO	to Success in Business 4	und Life
THREE		
	SIMPLE	
		STEPS

1) Draw any free state from the bath.

2) Perform any unitary that conserves the total energy.

#### Thermal operations

- Tend to thermalize states
- Each free operation consists of

THREE	
	SIMPLE
	STEPS

1) Draw any free state from the bath.

2) Perform any unitary that conserves the total energy.

3) Discard a subsystem.

•  $(\rho, H) \mapsto$ 

•  $(\rho, H) \mapsto \left( \qquad \rho \otimes \frac{e^{-\beta H_{\rm B}}}{Z} \right)$ 

• 
$$(\rho, H) \mapsto \left( \qquad U \left[ \rho \otimes \frac{e^{-\beta H_{\rm B}}}{Z} \right] U^{\dagger} \right)$$

• 
$$(\rho, H) \mapsto \left( \qquad U \left[ \rho \otimes \frac{e^{-\beta H_{\rm B}}}{Z} \right] U^{\dagger} \right)$$

• 
$$[U, H_{\text{tot}}] = 0$$

• 
$$(\rho, H) \mapsto \left( \qquad U \left[ \rho \otimes \frac{e^{-\beta H_{\rm B}}}{Z} \right] U^{\dagger} \right)$$

• 
$$[U, H_{tot}] = 0$$
  
 $\parallel$   
 $H + H_{B} \equiv (H \otimes 1) + (1 \otimes H_{B})$ 

• 
$$(\rho, H) \mapsto \left( \qquad U \left[ \rho \otimes \frac{e^{-\beta H_{\rm B}}}{Z} \right] U^{\dagger} \right)$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} U, H_{\text{tot}} \end{bmatrix} = 0$$
  

$$\parallel$$
  

$$H + H_{\text{B}} \equiv (H \otimes 1) + (1 \otimes H_{\text{B}})$$
  

$$\begin{bmatrix} \sim \text{First law of} \\ \text{thermodynamics} \end{bmatrix}$$

• 
$$(\rho, H) \mapsto \left( \operatorname{Tr}_{a} \left( U \left[ \rho \otimes \frac{e^{-\beta H_{B}}}{Z} \right] U^{\dagger} \right), \right)$$

• 
$$[U, H_{tot}] = 0$$
  
 $\parallel$   
 $H + H_{B} \equiv (H \otimes 1) + (1 \otimes H_{B})$   
 $-$  First law of thermodynamics

• 
$$(\rho, H) \mapsto \left( \operatorname{Tr}_{a} \left( U \left[ \rho \otimes \frac{e^{-\beta H_{B}}}{Z} \right] U^{\dagger} \right), H + H_{B} - H_{a} \right)$$

•  $[U, H_{tot}] = 0$   $\|$   $H + H_{B} \equiv (H \otimes 1) + (1 \otimes H_{B})$ - First law of thermodynamics



#### NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).

• <u>Hilbert space</u>:  $\mathscr{H}_{mol}$ 



• <u>Hilbert space</u>:  $\mathscr{H}_{mol} = \mathscr{H}_{elec} \otimes \mathscr{H}_{nuc}$ 



• <u>Hilbert space</u>:  $\mathscr{H}_{mol} = \mathscr{H}_{elec} \otimes \mathscr{H}_{nuc}$ 



• <u>Hamiltonian</u>:  $H_{mol} =$ 

• <u>Hilbert space</u>:  $\mathscr{H}_{mol} = \mathscr{H}_{elec} \otimes \mathscr{H}_{nuc}$ 



• <u>Hamiltonian</u>:  $H_{mol} =$ 



• <u>Hilbert space</u>:  $\mathscr{H}_{mol} = \mathscr{H}_{elec} \otimes \mathscr{H}_{nuc}$ 



• Hamiltonian: 
$$H_{\rm mol} = \int_0^{\pi} d\varphi$$

$$\ell_{\rm elec} \otimes \frac{\ell_{\varphi}^2}{2m}$$

• <u>Hilbert space</u>:  $\mathscr{H}_{mol} = \mathscr{H}_{elec} \otimes \mathscr{H}_{nuc}$ 



• Hamiltonian: 
$$H_{\text{mol}} = \int_0^{\pi} d\varphi \left[ H_{\text{elec}}(\varphi) \otimes |\varphi\rangle \langle \varphi| + 1_{\text{elec}} \otimes \frac{\ell_{\varphi}^2}{2m} \right]$$





<u>Initial molecule-and-laser state</u>:  $e^{-\beta H_{mol}}/Z_{mol} \otimes \rho_{laser}$ 



<u>Initial molecule-and-laser state</u>:  $e^{-\beta H_{mol}}/Z_{mol} \otimes \rho_{laser} \mapsto$  (photoexcitation)



<u>Initial molecule-and-laser state</u>:  $e^{-\beta H_{mol}}/Z_{mol} \otimes \rho_{laser} \mapsto (photoexcitation)$ 

 $\rho_{\rm elec} \otimes |\varphi = 0\rangle \langle \varphi = 0|$ 



Initial molecule-and-laser state:  $e^{-\beta H_{mol}}/Z_{mol} \otimes \rho_{laser} \mapsto (photoexcitation)$ 

 $\rho_{\rm elec} \otimes |\varphi = 0\rangle \langle \varphi = 0| \mapsto$  (rotation)



<u>Initial molecule-and-laser state</u>:  $e^{-\beta H_{mol}}/Z_{mol} \otimes \rho_{laser} \mapsto$  (photoexcitation)

 $\rho_{\rm elec} \otimes |\varphi = 0\rangle \langle \varphi = 0| \mapsto$  (rotation)





• How large a probability weight can the final state have on the lower level?



# Second laws of thermodynamics



## Second laws of thermodynamics

Theorems proved with help from the resource theory

## Second law in conventional thermodynamics

# Second law in conventional thermodynamics






• Can a system transition from one state to another spontaneously?



- Can a system transition from one state to another spontaneously?
  - Compare free energies.  $\longrightarrow F = E TS$



- Can a system transition from one state to another spontaneously?
  - Compare free energies.  $\longrightarrow F = E TS$
- Do they satisfy (the appropriate manifestation of) the second law?  $\longrightarrow \Delta F \leq 0$



- Can a system transition from one state to another spontaneously?
  - Compare free energies.  $\longrightarrow F = E TS$
- Do they satisfy (the appropriate manifestation of) the second law?  $\longrightarrow \Delta F \leq 0$ 
  - Setting: equilibrium, large-system limit, implicit averaging







• Does any free operation map  $(\rho, H)$  to  $(\sigma, H')$ ?



- Does any free operation map  $(\rho, H)$  to  $(\sigma, H')$ ?
- Must check a family of inequalities —> "second laws"



• One subfamily of inequalities governs the state's energy diagonal.

• One subfamily of inequalities governs the state's energy diagonal.  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H')?$ 

• One subfamily of inequalities governs the state's energy diagonal.

$$\begin{array}{c} (\rho,H)\mapsto(\sigma,H')?\\ \hline \\ H\\ \end{array}\\ \begin{bmatrix} p_1 & a & c\\ a^* & p_2 & b\\ c^* & b^* & \ddots\\ & & & \\ & & & & \\ \end{array} \end{array}$$

• One subfamily of inequalities governs the state's energy diagonal.

$$(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H')?$$

$$\downarrow H$$

$$p_1 \quad a \quad c$$

$$a^* \quad p_2 \quad b$$

$$c^* \quad b^* \quad \ddots$$

$$p_d$$

• One subfamily of inequalities governs the state's energy diagonal.

$$(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H')?$$

$$\downarrow H$$

$$p_1 \quad a \quad c$$

$$a^* \quad p_2 \quad b$$

$$c^* \quad b^* \quad \ddots \qquad p_d$$

• Another subfamily governs the coherences.

• One subfamily of inequalities governs the state's energy diagonal.



- Another subfamily governs the coherences.
- We want to bound a diagonal element.



 $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H')?$ 



$$\begin{array}{c} (\rho,H)\mapsto(\sigma,H')?\\ \checkmark\\ \rho_{\rm elec}\otimes|\,\varphi=0\rangle\langle\varphi=0\,| \end{array}$$



$$\begin{array}{c} (\rho,H)\mapsto(\sigma,H')?\\ \bigstar & \uparrow\\ \rho_{\rm elec}\otimes |\varphi=0\rangle\langle \varphi=0| & \sigma \end{array}$$



$$\begin{split}
\rho_{\text{elec}} \otimes |\varphi = 0\rangle\langle\varphi = 0| & \sigma \\
H_{\text{mol}} = \int_{0}^{\pi} d\varphi \left[ H_{\text{elec}}(\varphi) \otimes |\varphi\rangle\langle\varphi| + 1_{\text{elec}} \otimes \frac{\ell_{\varphi}^{2}}{2m} \right]
\end{split}$$



$$(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H')?$$

$$H_{\text{mol}} = \int_{0}^{\pi} d\varphi \left[ H_{\text{elec}}(\varphi) \otimes |\varphi\rangle \langle \varphi| + 1_{\text{elec}} \otimes \frac{\ell_{\varphi}^{2}}{2m} \right]$$
Effective 4-level system:
$$\varphi = 0 \qquad \varphi = \pi$$

$$(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H')?$$

$$H_{\text{mol}} = \int_{0}^{\pi} d\varphi \left[ H_{\text{elec}}(\varphi) \otimes |\varphi\rangle \langle \varphi| + 1_{\text{elec}} \otimes \frac{\ell_{\varphi}^{2}}{2m} \right]$$
Effective 4-level system:  
(2 nuclear states)  
× (2 electronic states)

Coherence theorem

#### Coherence theorem

A density operator can be broken into modes, each defined by a gap.

$$\begin{bmatrix} p_1 & a & c \\ a^* & p_2 & b \\ c^* & b^* & \ddots \\ & & & p_d \end{bmatrix}$$

#### <u>Coherence theorem</u>

A density operator can be broken into modes, each defined by a gap.



#### <u>Coherence theorem</u>

A density operator can be broken into modes, each defined by a gap.



#### <u>Coherence theorem</u>

A density operator can be broken into modes, each defined by a gap.



#### <u>Coherence theorem</u>

A density operator can be broken into modes, each defined by a gap. The modes transform independently under thermal operations.



Implication for photoisomer

• We want to bound a diagonal element.

- We want to bound a diagonal element.
- Coherences can't affect it, in the absence of external resources.

- We want to bound a diagonal element.
- Coherences can't affect it, in the absence of external resources.
- So our bound will depend on just the states' diagonal elements.

- We want to bound a diagonal element.
- Coherences can't affect it, in the absence of external resources.
- So our bound will depend on just the states' diagonal elements.
- So, in our calculations, we can replace the states with decohered states.

- We want to bound a diagonal element.
- Coherences can't affect it, in the absence of external resources.
- So our bound will depend on just the states' diagonal elements.
- So, in our calculations, we can replace the states with decohered states.



- We want to bound a diagonal element.
- Coherences can't affect it, in the absence of external resources.
- So our bound will depend on just the states' diagonal elements.
- So, in our calculations, we can replace the states with decohered states.



- We want to bound a diagonal element.
- Coherences can't affect it, in the absence of external resources.
- So our bound will depend on just the states' diagonal elements.
- So, in our calculations, we can replace the states with decohered states.


### Applying the second laws of thermodynamics to the photoisomer

### Implication for photoisomer

- We want to bound a diagonal element.
- Coherences can't affect it, in the absence of external resources.
- So our bound will depend on just the states' diagonal elements.
- So, in our calculations, we can replace the states with decohered states.



### Applying the second laws of thermodynamics to the photoisomer

### Implication for photoisomer

- We want to bound a diagonal element.
- Coherences can't affect it, in the absence of external resources.
- So our bound will depend on just the states' diagonal elements.
- So, in our calculations, we can replace the states with decohered states.



• Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000). Horodecki and Oppenheim, Nat. Comm. **4**, 2059 (2013).

• Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000). Horodecki and Oppenheim, Nat. Comm. **4**, 2059 (2013).

• Mathematical toolkit: *d*-majorization

• Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000). Horodecki and Oppenheim, Nat. Comm. **4**, 2059 (2013).

• Mathematical toolkit: *d*-majorization

How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free

• Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000). Horodecki and Oppenheim, Nat. Comm. **4**, 2059 (2013).

• Mathematical toolkit: *d*-majorization

How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free

• Rescale each probability with an inverse Boltzmann factor.

$$r_{\mu} \mapsto r_{\mu} e^{\beta E_{\mu}}$$

• Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000). Horodecki and Oppenheim, Nat. Comm. **4**, 2059 (2013).

• Mathematical toolkit: *d*-majorization

How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free

• Rescale each probability with an inverse Boltzmann factor.



• Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000). Horodecki and Oppenheim, Nat. Comm. **4**, 2059 (2013).

• Mathematical toolkit: *d*-majorization

How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free

• Rescale each probability with an inverse Boltzmann factor.

 $r_{\mu} \mapsto r_{\mu} e^{\beta E_{\mu}}$ Informational resource Energetic resource

• Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000). Horodecki and Oppenheim, Nat. Comm. **4**, 2059 (2013).

• Mathematical toolkit: *d*-majorization

How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free

• Rescale each probability with an inverse Boltzmann factor.



Order the rescaled probabilities from greatest to least.

 $r_1 e^{\beta E_1} \ge r_2 e^{\beta E_2} \ge \dots \ge r_d e^{\beta E_d}$ 

• Janzing *et al.*, Int. J. Theor. Phys. **39**, 12 (2000). Horodecki and Oppenheim, Nat. Comm. **4**, 2059 (2013).

• Mathematical toolkit: *d*-majorization

How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free

• Rescale each probability with an inverse Boltzmann factor.



• Order the rescaled probabilities from greatest to least.

 $r_1 e^{\beta E_1} \ge r_2 e^{\beta E_2} \ge \dots \ge r_d e^{\beta E_d}$ 

• Plot partial sums.

How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free



How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free



How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free



Gibbs-rescaled Lorenz curve

 Geometric representation of the energy diagonal's thermodynamic value

How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free

• Plot the  $(\rho, H)$  and  $(\sigma, H)$  curves on the same plot.



How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free

- Plot the  $(\rho, H)$  and  $(\sigma, H)$  curves on the same plot.
- <u>Theorem</u>:  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  if and only if the  $(\rho, H)$  curve lies, everywhere, above or on the  $(\sigma, H)$  curve.



How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free

- Plot the  $(\rho, H)$  and  $(\sigma, H)$  curves on the same plot.
- <u>Theorem</u>:  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  if and only if the  $(\rho, H)$  curve lies, everywhere, above or on the  $(\sigma, H)$  curve.



How to check whether  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  for free

- Plot the  $(\rho, H)$  and  $(\sigma, H)$  curves on the same plot.
- <u>Theorem</u>:  $(\rho, H) \mapsto (\sigma, H)$  if and only if the  $(\rho, H)$  curve lies, everywhere, above or on the  $(\sigma, H)$  curve.

Encodes a bunch of inequalities



# Apply the second laws of thermodynamics to the photoisomer.



NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).

<u>Strategy</u>

### <u>Strategy</u>

• For any state  $\rho$  to which the laser can excite the molecule,



### <u>Strategy</u>

 For any state ρ to which the laser can excite the molecule, four parameters specify the final state.



### <u>Strategy</u>

- For any state ρ to which the laser can excite the molecule, four parameters specify the final state.
- Plug into the second laws for the energy diagonal.



### <u>Strategy</u>

- For any state ρ to which the laser can excite the molecule, four parameters specify the final state.
- Plug into the second laws for the energy diagonal.
- Solve for the greatest  $s_{-}^{\text{trans}}$  for which the  $\rho$  curve lies above/on the  $\sigma$  curve.













 $\beta \Delta E$ 















## Takeaways

• We've derived fundamental thermodynamic limitations on the molecule's switching probability
- We've derived fundamental thermodynamic limitations on the molecule's switching probability
- When the laser is poor (as in some realistic settings), the resource-theory bound constrains the yield tightly.

- We've derived fundamental thermodynamic limitations on the molecule's switching probability
- When the laser is poor (as in some realistic settings), the resource-theory bound constrains the yield tightly.
- We can understand the bound through energetic and informational resources.

- We've derived fundamental thermodynamic limitations on the molecule's switching probability
- When the laser is poor (as in some realistic settings), the resource-theory bound constrains the yield tightly.
- We can understand the bound through energetic and informational resources.
  - Using a Lindblad model, we can find a parameter regime in which the resource-theory bound is saturated.

- We've derived fundamental thermodynamic limitations on the molecule's switching probability
- When the laser is poor (as in some realistic settings), the resource-theory bound constrains the yield tightly.
- We can understand the bound through energetic and informational resources.
  - Using a Lindblad model, we can find a parameter regime in which the resource-theory bound is saturated.
    - Electronic energy coherences can't help.













(1) Model of the molecule's rotational degree of freedom as a quantum clock





10 AM:



Hopefully not now:





 $H_{\rm mol} = \int_0^{\pi} d\varphi \left[ H_{\rm elec}(\varphi) \otimes |\varphi\rangle \langle \varphi| + 1_{\rm elec} \otimes \frac{\ell_{\varphi}^2}{2m} \right]$ 

(1) Model of the molecule's rotational degree of freedom as a quantum clock

Loads of papers, including recently, including about thermodynamic resource theories

(1) Model of the molecule's rotational degree of freedom as a quantum clock

Loads of papers, including recently, including about thermodynamic resource theories

About energy  $\rightarrow$ conjugate to time  $\rightarrow$ measured by clocks

(1) Model of the molecule's rotational degree of freedom as a quantum clock

Loads of papers, including recently, including about thermodynamic resource theories

About energy  $\rightarrow$ conjugate to time  $\rightarrow$ measured by clocks

• <u>Upshots</u>

(1) Model of the molecule's rotational degree of freedom as a quantum clock

Loads of papers, including recently, including about <u>thermodynamic</u> resource theories

About energy  $\rightarrow$ conjugate to time  $\rightarrow$ measured by clocks

• <u>Upshots</u>

(A) Natural realization of a quantum clock

(1) Model of the molecule's rotational degree of freedom as a quantum clock

Loads of papers, including recently, including about thermodynamic resource theories

About energy  $\rightarrow$ conjugate to time  $\rightarrow$ measured by clocks

• <u>Upshots</u>

(A) Natural realization of a quantum clock

(B) Resource-theoretic model for a (dissipative Landau-Zener) transition prevalent in chemistry and condensed matter

(2) Extraction of work from coherences

(2) Extraction of work from coherences

(3) Quantification of the post-isomerization electronic energy coherences

(2) Extraction of work from coherences

(3) Quantification of the post-isomerization electronic energy coherences

(4) Etc.





: Theorem Corollary *Theorem* Theorem Lemma



• Let's apply them to answer preexisting questions about chemistry, condensed matter, high-energy physics, ...



- Let's apply them to answer preexisting questions about chemistry, condensed matter, high-energy physics, ...
  - Why should anyone outside the resource-theory community care about resource theories?



• NYH, "Toward physical realizations of thermodynamic resource theories," Springer Eds. Durham and Rickles (2015/2017).





• NYH, "Toward physical realizations of thermodynamic resource theories," Springer Eds. Durham and Rickles (2015/2017).



- Proposals of experiments designed to realize resource-theory results
  - Lörch, Bruder, Brunner, and Hofer, Q. Sci. and Tech. 3, 035014 (2018).
  - Holmes, Weidt, Jennings, Anders, and Mintert, Quantum 3, 124 (2019).



- NYH, "Toward physical realizations of thermodynamic resource theories," Springer Eds. Durham and Rickles (2015/2017).
- Proposals of experiments designed to realize resource-theory results
  - Lörch, Bruder, Brunner, and Hofer, Q. Sci. and Tech. 3, 035014 (2018).
  - Holmes, Weidt, Jennings, Anders, and Mintert, Quantum 3, 124 (2019).
- <u>See also</u>
  - Alhambra, Lostaglio, and Perry, arXiv:1807.07974 (2018).
  - Pusuluk, Farrow, Deliduman, Burnett, and Vedral, Proc. R. Soc. A 474, 20180037 (2018).
  - Chin and Huh, arXiv:1807.11187 (2018). ← BosonSampling
  - Song, Huang, Ling, and Yung, arXiv:1806.00715 (2018).
  - Cipolla and Landi, arXiv:1808.01224 (2018). ← Spin-boson model



### Goals

• Contribute value to the broader scientific community.



### Goals

- Contribute value to the broader scientific community.
  - Answer its open questions.



### Goals

- Contribute value to the broader scientific community.
  - Answer its open questions.
- Apply our abstract theorems to real physical systems.



### Goals

- Contribute value to the broader scientific community.
  - Answer its open questions.
- Apply our abstract theorems to real physical systems.

Potential settings



### Goals

- Contribute value to the broader scientific community.
  - Answer its open questions.
- Apply our abstract theorems to real physical systems.

#### Potential settings

• Exciton transport in films made from quantum dots



### Goals

- Contribute value to the broader scientific community.
  - Answer its open questions.
- Apply our abstract theorems to real physical systems.

### Potential settings

- Exciton transport in films made from quantum dots
  - Photovoltaics



### Goals

- Contribute value to the broader scientific community.
  - Answer its open questions.
- Apply our abstract theorems to real physical systems.

### Potential settings

- Exciton transport in films made from quantum dots
  - Photovoltaics
  - Proton transport in molecular systems



### Goals

- Contribute value to the broader scientific community.
  - Answer its open questions.
- Apply our abstract theorems to real physical systems.

#### Potential settings

- Exciton transport in films made from quantum dots
  - Photovoltaics

• ...
NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).

NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).



NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).



• Thermodynamic resource theories



NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).



- Thermodynamic resource theories
  - How to model your favorite system



NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).





## • Thermodynamic resource theories

- How to model your favorite system
- "Second laws" of thermodynamics



NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).





## • Thermodynamic resource theories

• How to model your favorite system



• Results



NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).





#### • Thermodynamic resource theories

• How to model your favorite system



#### • Results

• Modeled the photoisomer in a resource theory



NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).





## • Thermodynamic resource theories

• How to model your favorite system



#### • Results

- Modeled the photoisomer in a resource theory
- Bounded the photoisomerization probability, using second laws



NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).





## • Thermodynamic resource theories

• How to model your favorite system



#### • Results

- Modeled the photoisomer in a resource theory
- Bounded the photoisomerization probability, using second laws







# Thanks for your time!

NYH and Limmer, arXiv:1811.06551 (2018).



# Comparison of resource-theory bound with time-dependent Lindblad dynamics











• Not simply  $\mathscr{E}_+ - \mathscr{E}_-$ 



• Not simply  $\mathscr{E}_+ - \mathscr{E}_-$ 

• 
$$W_{\min}(\mathcal{D}(\rho), H) = \frac{1}{\beta} D_{\max}(\rho | | e^{-\beta H} / Z)$$



• Not simply  $\mathscr{E}_+ - \mathscr{E}_-$ 

• 
$$W_{\min}(\mathcal{D}(\rho), H) = \frac{1}{\beta} D_{\max}(\rho | | e^{-\beta H} / Z)$$



• Not simply  $\mathscr{E}_+ - \mathscr{E}_-$ 

•  $W_{\min}(\mathcal{D}(\rho), H) = \frac{1}{\beta} D_{\max}(\rho || e^{-\beta H}/Z) \longrightarrow D_{\max}(\rho || \sigma) := \log\left(\min\{c \in \mathbb{R} : \rho \le c\sigma\}\right)$ 



• Not simply  $\mathscr{E}_+ - \mathscr{E}_-$ 



• Not simply  $\mathscr{E}_+ - \mathscr{E}_-$ 

$$= \min\left\{\mathscr{C}_{+} - \frac{1}{\beta}\log\left(\frac{1}{p_{+}}\right), \frac{1}{\beta}\log\left(\frac{1}{p_{-}}\right)\right\} - \left(\frac{-1}{\beta}\log Z_{\mathrm{mol}}\right)$$



• Not simply  $\mathscr{E}_+ - \mathscr{E}_-$ 

$$= \min\left\{\mathscr{C}_{+} - \frac{1}{\beta}\log\left(\frac{1}{p_{+}}\right), \frac{1}{\beta}\log\left(\frac{1}{p_{-}}\right)\right\} - \left(\frac{-1}{\beta}\log Z_{\text{mol}}\right)$$
$$\sim E - TS$$



• Not simply  $\mathscr{E}_+ - \mathscr{E}_-$ 

$$= \min\left\{\mathscr{C}_{+} - \frac{1}{\beta}\log\left(\frac{1}{p_{+}}\right), \frac{1}{\beta}\log\left(\frac{1}{p_{-}}\right)\right\} - \left(\frac{-1}{\beta}\log Z_{\text{mol}}\right)$$

$$\sim E - TS$$



• Not simply  $\mathscr{C}_+ - \mathscr{C}_-$ 

•  $W_{\min}(\mathscr{D}(\rho), H) = \frac{1}{\beta} D_{\max}(\rho || e^{-\beta H} / Z) \longrightarrow D_{\max}(\rho || \sigma) := \log (\min\{c \in \mathbb{R} : \rho \le c\sigma\})$ (State discrimination in the worst case)

$$= \min \left\{ \mathscr{C}_{+} - \frac{1}{\beta} \log \left( \frac{1}{p_{+}} \right), \frac{1}{\beta} \log \left( \frac{1}{p_{-}} \right) \right\} - \left( \frac{-1}{\beta} \log Z_{\text{mol}} \right)$$

$$\sim E - TS$$

 $\sim F_{\rm noneq} - F_{\rm eq}$ 





• Known from resource theory:



Known from resource theory: Can extract work from coherences between degenerate energy levels • without changing the populations



Known from resource theory: Can extract work from coherences between degenerate energy levels • without changing the populations

$$p \xrightarrow{H} \begin{bmatrix} p_1 & a & c \\ a^* & p_2 & b \\ c^* & b^* & p_3 \\ & & \ddots \\ & & & & p_d \end{bmatrix}$$



Known from resource theory: Can extract work from coherences between degenerate energy levels • without changing the populations

$$\rho \xrightarrow{H} \begin{bmatrix} p_1 & a & c \\ a^* & p_2 & b \\ c^* & b^* & p_3 \\ & & \ddots \\ & & & p_d \end{bmatrix} \xleftarrow{E}$$



Known from resource theory: Can extract work from coherences between degenerate energy levels • without changing the populations

$$\rho \xrightarrow{H} \begin{bmatrix} p_1 & a & c \\ a^* & p_2 & b \\ c^* & b^* & p_3 \end{bmatrix} \underbrace{\longleftarrow E}_{\bullet} E$$



Physical intuition



**Physical intuition** 

• Coherent state has more purity



#### **Physical intuition**

Coherent state has more purity — more predictability



#### **Physical intuition**

 Coherent state has more purity — more predictability more informational resource



#### Physical intuition

- more informational resource
  - Szilárd's engine: can use information to turn heat into work — Szilárd, Zeit. F. Phys. **53**, 11-12 (1929).



<u>Strategy</u>

• Follow Kwon et al. PRL **120**, 150602 (2018).



#### Strategy

• Follow Kwon *et al.* PRL **120**, 150602 (2018). → Exhibits an example 2-qubit system from whose coherences work can be extracted


#### Strategy

- Follow Kwon *et al.* PRL **120**, 150602 (2018). → Exhibits an example 2-qubit system from whose coherences work can be extracted
- Show that, in principle, such a state can be constructed from photoisomers.



• Kwon et al. PRL **120**, 150602 (2018).



- Kwon et al. PRL **120**, 150602 (2018).
- System of 2 identical qubits:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} + & E_{+} \\ - & E_{-} \end{array} \begin{array}{c} + & E_{+} \\ - & E_{-} \end{array}$$



- Kwon et al. PRL 120, 150602 (2018).
- System of 2 identical qubits:

$$\begin{array}{c} + E_{+} \\ - E_{-} \end{array} \begin{array}{c} + E_{+} \\ - E_{-} \end{array}$$

• General form of 2-qubit pure state:

 $\sqrt{p_{--}} \left| E_{-}, E_{-} \right\rangle + \sqrt{p_{-+}} \left| E_{-}, E_{+} \right\rangle + \sqrt{p_{+-}} \left| E_{+}, E_{-} \right\rangle + \sqrt{p_{++}} \left| E_{+}, E_{+} \right\rangle$ 



- Kwon et al. PRL 120, 150602 (2018).
- System of 2 identical qubits:

$$\begin{array}{c} \bullet & E_+ \\ \bullet & E_- \end{array} \end{array} \begin{array}{c} \bullet & E_+ \\ \bullet & E_- \end{array}$$

• General form of 2-qubit pure state:

 $\sqrt{p_{--}} \left| E_{-}, E_{-} \right\rangle + \sqrt{p_{-+}} \left| E_{-}, E_{+} \right\rangle + \sqrt{p_{+-}} \left| E_{+}, E_{-} \right\rangle + \sqrt{p_{++}} \left| E_{+}, E_{+} \right\rangle$ 

<u>Conditions under which work can be extracted from coherence</u>



- Kwon et al. PRL **120**, 150602 (2018).
- System of 2 identical qubits:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} + & E_{+} \\ + & E_{-} \end{array} \begin{array}{c} + & E_{+} \\ + & E_{-} \end{array}$$

• General form of 2-qubit pure state:

 $\sqrt{p_{--}} \left| E_{-}, E_{-} \right\rangle + \sqrt{p_{-+}} \left| E_{-}, E_{+} \right\rangle + \sqrt{p_{+-}} \left| E_{+}, E_{-} \right\rangle + \sqrt{p_{++}} \left| E_{+}, E_{+} \right\rangle$ 

Conditions under which work can be extracted from coherence •

(i) The equal-energy terms have equal prefactors:  $\sqrt{p_{-+}} = \sqrt{p_{+-}}$ .



- Kwon et al. PRL **120**, 150602 (2018).
- System of 2 identical qubits:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} + & E_{+} \\ + & E_{-} \end{array} \begin{array}{c} + & E_{+} \\ + & E_{-} \end{array}$$

• General form of 2-qubit pure state:

 $\sqrt{p_{--}} | E_{-}, E_{-} \rangle + \sqrt{p_{-+}} | E_{-}, E_{+} \rangle + \sqrt{p_{+-}} | E_{+}, E_{-} \rangle + \sqrt{p_{++}} | E_{+}, E_{+} \rangle$ 

Conditions under which work can be extracted from coherence •

(i) The equal-energy terms have equal prefactors:  $\sqrt{p_{-+}} = \sqrt{p_{+-}}$ .

(ii) The greatest Gibbs-rescaled probability is  $p_{+-}$ .





• 2 isomers close together in small, symmetric structure



 $2\lambda$ 

 $\varphi$ 



- 2 isomers close together in small, symmetric structure
  - Occupy a totally anti/symmetric state



 $2\lambda$ 

 $\varphi$ 



- 2 isomers close together in small, symmetric structure
  - Occupy a totally anti/symmetric state



 $2\lambda$ 

• Interact via Heisenberg coupling,  $\overrightarrow{\sigma} \cdot \overrightarrow{\sigma}$ , at very low temperature



- 2 isomers close together in small, symmetric structure
  - Occupy a totally anti/symmetric state



- Interact via Heisenberg coupling,  $\vec{\sigma} \cdot \vec{\sigma}$ , at very low temperature  $\longrightarrow$
- By end of photoisomerization, they drop to the ground, antisymmetric state.

$$\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\left| \mathcal{E}_{+}(\pi), \mathcal{E}_{-}(\pi) \right\rangle - \left| \mathcal{E}_{-}(\pi), \mathcal{E}_{+}(\pi) \right\rangle)$$



• The isomers decouple quickly.



$$\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(|\mathscr{E}_{+}(\pi),\mathscr{E}_{-}(\pi)\rangle - |\mathscr{E}_{-}(\pi),\mathscr{E}_{+}(\pi)\rangle)$$

 $\varphi$ 



- The isomers decouple quickly.
- The Hamiltonian returns to  $H_{\rm mol} + H_{\rm mol}$ .

 $2\lambda$ 



 $\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(|\mathscr{E}_{+}(\pi),\mathscr{E}_{-}(\pi)\rangle - |\mathscr{E}_{-}(\pi),\mathscr{E}_{+}(\pi)\rangle)$ 

 $\varphi$ 





- The isomers decouple quickly.
- The Hamiltonian returns to  $H_{\rm mol} + H_{\rm mol}$  . The state remains constant.



$$\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\,|\,\mathscr{E}_+(\pi),\,\mathscr{E}_-(\pi)\rangle-\,|\,\mathscr{E}_-(\pi),\,\mathscr{E}_+(\pi)\rangle)$$

 $\varphi$ 





- The isomers decouple quickly.
- The Hamiltonian returns to  $H_{\rm mol} + H_{\rm mol}$  . The state remains constant.



 $\stackrel{\varphi}{\bullet}$  The state satisfies the Kwon *et al.* conditions.

$$\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\left| \mathcal{E}_{+}(\pi), \mathcal{E}_{-}(\pi) \right\rangle - \left| \mathcal{E}_{-}(\pi), \mathcal{E}_{+}(\pi) \right\rangle)$$

